# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA STATESBORO DIVISION

RONALD DEXTER RADFORD.

Plaintiff,

VS.

CIVIL ACTION NO.: CV605-029

HUGH SMITH, Warden, and JIMMY KENNEDY, Library Supervisor,

Defendants.

#### ORDER

Plaintiff, an inmate presently confined at Georgia State Prison in Reidsville, Georgia, filed an action pursuant to 42 U.S.C.A. § 1983 contesting the conditions of his confinement. In a Report and Recommendation dated June 7, 2005, the undersigned recommended that Plaintiff's claims against Defendants Smith and Kennedy be dismissed due to Plaintiff's failure to set forth any factual allegations against these individuals and due to Plaintiff's apparent desire to hold these individuals liable based on their supervisory positions. Plaintiff has filed Objections to this Report and Recommendation. Based on Plaintiff's Objections, the undersigned's Report and Recommendation dated June 7, 2005, is VACATED.

28 U.S.C.A. § 1915A requires a district court to screen the complaint for cognizable claims before or as soon as possible after docketing. The court must dismiss the complaint or any portion of the complaint that is frivolous, malicious, fails to state a claim upon which relief may granted, or seeks monetary damages from a defendant who is immune from such relief. 28 U.S.C.A. § 1915A(b)(1) and (2).

In <u>Mitchell v. Farcass</u>, 112 F.3d 1483, 1490 (11th Cir. 1997), the Eleventh Circuit interpreted the language contained in 28 U.S.C.A. § 1915(e)(2)(B)(ii), which is nearly identical to that contained in the screening provisions at § 1915A(b). As the language of § 1915(e)(2)(B)(ii) closely tracks the language of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6), the court held that the same standards for determining whether to dismiss for failure to state a claim under Rule 12(b)(6) should be applied to prisoner complaints filed pursuant to § 1915(e)(2)(B)(ii). <u>Mitchell</u>, 112 F.3d at 1490. The court may dismiss a complaint for failure to state a claim only where it appears beyond a doubt that a *pro se* litigant can prove no set of facts that would entitle him to relief. <u>Hughes v. Rowe</u>, 449 U.S. 5, 10, 101 S. Ct. 173, 176, 66 L. Ed.2d 163, 169-70 (1980); <u>Mitchell</u>, 112 F.3d at 1490. While the court in <u>Mitchell</u> interpreted § 1915(e), its interpretation guides this court in applying the identical language of § 1915A.

In his Objections, Plaintiff contends that Jimmy Kennedy, the library supervisor at Georgia State Prison, refused to give him the forms he needed in order to file an appeal with the United States Supreme Court. Plaintiff contends that he was unable to file an appeal with the Supreme Court, which prejudiced his cause of action. Plaintiff also asserts that Hugh Smith, the Warden at Georgia State Prison, improperly denied his grievance on this matter by stating that Plaintiff did not file his grievance within the time limits. Plaintiff asserts that Defendants' actions denied him his constitutional right to access to the courts.

Prisoners have a constitutional right to "adequate, effective and meaningful" access to the courts. Bounds v. Smith, 430 U.S. 817, 822, 97 S. Ct. 1491, 1495, 52 L. Ed.2d 72 (1977). To constitute a deprivation of the right to access the courts, a prisoner "must show actual injury in the pursuit of specific types of nonfrivolous cases[.]" Wilson v. Blankenship,

163 F.3d 1284, 1290 (11th Cir. 1998) (citing Lewis v. Casey, 518 U.S. 343, 355-57, 116 S. Ct. 2174, 2182, 135 L. Ed.2d 606(1996)).

The above set forth allegations, when read in a light most favorable to Plaintiff, arguably state colorable claims for relief under 42 U.S.C.A. § 1983 and 28 U.S.C.A. § 1915A against Defendants Kennedy and Smith. A copy of Plaintiff's Complaint, Plaintiff's Objections (including his attached exhibits), and a copy of this Order shall be served upon Defendants Kennedy and Smith by the United States Marshal without prepayment of cost. If either Defendant elects to file a Waiver of Reply, then he must file either a dispositive motion or an answer to the complaint within thirty (30) days of the filing of said Waiver of Reply.

Plaintiff's remaining claim set forth in his Objections is addressed in a Report and Recommendation of even date.

#### **INSTRUCTIONS TO DEFENDANTS**

Since the Plaintiff is authorized to proceed in forma pauperis, service must be effected by the United States Marshal. Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(c)(2). In most cases, the marshal will first mail a copy of the complaint to the Defendants by first-class mail and request that the Defendants waive formal service of summons. Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(d); Local Rule 4.5. Individual and corporate defendants have a duty to avoid unnecessary costs of serving the summons, and any such defendant who fails to comply with the request for waiver must bear the costs of personal service unless good cause can be shown for the failure to return the waiver. Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(d)(2). Generally, a defendant who timely returns the waiver is not required to answer the complaint until sixty (60) days after the date that the marshal sent the request for waiver. Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(d)(3).

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants are hereby granted leave of court to take the deposition of the Plaintiff upon oral examination. Fed. R. Civ. P. 30(a). The Defendants shall ensure that the Plaintiff's deposition and any other depositions in the case are taken within the 140-day discovery period allowed by this court's local rules. Local Rule 26.1(d)(l).

In the event Defendants take the deposition of any other person, they are ordered to comply with the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 30 as set forth herein. As the Plaintiff will likely not be in attendance for such a deposition, the Defendants shall notify Plaintiff of the deposition and advise him that he may serve on the Defendants, in a sealed envelope, within ten (10) days of the notice of deposition, written questions the Plaintiff wishes to propound to the witness, if any. The Defendants shall present such questions to the witness seriatim during the deposition. Fed. R. Civ. P. 30(c).

#### INSTRUCTIONS TO PLAINTIFF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Plaintiff shall serve upon Defendants or, if appearance has been entered by counsel, upon their attorney, a copy of every further pleading or other document submitted for consideration by the court. Plaintiff shall include with the original paper to be filed with the Clerk of Court a certificate stating the date on which a true and correct copy of any document was mailed to Defendants or counsel. Fed. R. Civ. P. 5. "Every pleading shall contain a caption setting forth the name of the court, the title of the action, [and] the file number . . . ." Fed. R. Civ. P. 10(a). Any paper received by a district judge or magistrate judge which has not been filed with the Clerk or which fails to include a caption or a certificate of service will be disregarded by the court and returned to the sender.

Plaintiff is charged with the responsibility of immediately informing this Court and defense counsel of any change of address during the pendency of this action. Local Rule 11.1. Failure to do so may result in dismissal of this case.

Plaintiff has the responsibility for pursuing this case. For example, if Plaintiff wishes to obtain facts and information about the case from Defendants, Plaintiff must initiate discovery. See generally Fed. R. Civ. P. 26, et seq. Plaintiff does not need the permission of the court to begin discovery, and Plaintiff should begin discovery promptly and complete it within 140 days after the filing of the answer. Local Rule 26.1(d)(l).

Interrogatories are a practical method of discovery for incarcerated persons. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 33. Interrogatories may be served only on a party to the litigation, and, for the purposes of the instant case, this means that interrogatories should not be directed to persons or organizations who are not named as Defendants. Interrogatories shall not be filed with the court. Local Rule 26.4. Interrogatories are not to contain more than twentyfive (25) questions. Fed. R. Civ. P. 33(a). If Plaintiff wishes to propound more than twentyfive (25) interrogatories to a party, Plaintiff must have permission of the court. If Plaintiff wishes to file a motion to compel, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 37, he should first contact the attorney for the Defendants and try to work out the problem; if Plaintiff proceeds with the motion to compel, he should also file a statement certifying that he has contacted opposing counsel in a good faith effort to resolve any dispute about discovery. Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c); 37(a)(2); Local Rule 26.5. Plaintiff has the responsibility for maintaining his own records of the case. If Plaintiff loses papers and needs new copies, he may obtain them from the Clerk of Court at the standard cost of fifty (\$.50) cents per page.

If Plaintiff does not press his case forward, the court may dismiss it for want of prosecution. Fed. R. Civ. P. 41; Local Rule 41.1.

It is the Plaintiff's duty to cooperate fully in any discovery which may be initiated by the Defendants. Upon no less than five (5) days notice of the scheduled deposition date, the Plaintiff shall appear and permit his deposition to be taken and shall answer, under oath or solemn affirmation, any question which seeks information relevant to the subject matter of the pending action. Failing to answer questions at the deposition or giving evasive or incomplete responses to questions will not be tolerated and may subject Plaintiff to severe sanctions, including dismissal of this case.

As the case progresses, Plaintiff may receive a notice addressed to "counsel of record" directing the parties to prepare and submit a Joint Status Report and a Proposed Pretrial Order. A plaintiff proceeding without counsel may prepare and file a unilateral Status Report and is <u>required</u> to prepare and file his own version of the Proposed Pretrial Order. A plaintiff who is incarcerated shall not be required or entitled to attend any status or pretrial conference which may be scheduled by the court.

## ADDITIONAL INSTRUCTIONS TO PLAINTIFF REGARDING MOTIONS TO DISMISS AND MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

Under this Court's Local Rules, a party opposing a motion to dismiss shall file and serve his response to the motion within fifteen (15) days of its service. "Failure to respond shall indicate that there is no opposition to a motion." Local Rule 7.5. Therefore, if you fail to respond to a motion to dismiss, the Court will assume that you do not oppose the Defendants' motion.

Your response to a motion for summary judgment must be filed within twenty (20) days after service of the motion. Local Rules 7.5, 56.1. The failure to respond to such a motion shall indicate that there is no opposition to the motion. Furthermore, each material fact set forth in the Defendants' statement of material facts will be deemed admitted unless specifically controverted by an opposition statement. Should the Defendants file a motion for summary judgment, you are advised that you will have the burden of establishing the existence of a genuine issue as to any material fact in this case. That burden cannot be carried by reliance on the conclusory allegations contained within the complaint. Should the Defendants' motion for summary judgment be supported by affidavit, you must file counter-affidavits if you desire to contest the Defendants' statement of the facts. Should you fail to file opposing affidavits setting forth specific facts showing that there is a genuine issue for trial, the consequences are these: any factual assertions made in Defendants' affidavits will be accepted as true and summary judgment will be entered against the Plaintiff pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56.

SO ORDERED, this 15 day of August, 2005.

JÁMES E. GRAHAM

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

## **United States District Court**

### Southern District of Georgia

RADFO	RD	)			
vs		)	CASE NUMBER CV605-29		
SMITH, ET AL		)	DIVISION	STATESBORO	
di					ffice of the Clerk of this does hereby certify the
1	duties, I pe	ersonally placed in	rom the Court and in the United States Maions, parties or attorney	l a sealed	l envelope, and properly
2.	That the af 8/15/05		eloped contained a cop which is part of the of	-	
Date of M	Mailing:	8/15/05			
Date of C	Certificate	🗶 sam	e date, or		
			Scott L. Poff, Clerk		
			By: Jaylor, Deputy Clerk		
Name and Ronald Rad		leorgia State Prison 2	164 GA Hwy 147, Reidsvi	11e GA 30.	400
		2001gia 5tate 1 12501i, 2	10+ Oll IIwy 147, Reidsvi	ne, an so	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
					Copy placed in Minutes
				<u></u>	Copy given to Judge Copy given to Magistrate